

T06P02 / Educational policies application outside the original territory for which they were created

Topic : T06 / POLICY IMPLEMENTATION

Chair : Rubén Palacio (Universidad de Medellín)

Second Chair : Esteban Vasquez (Universidad de Medellín)

Third Chair : Sebastian Hurtado Correa (Universidad de Medellín)

GENERAL OBJECTIVES, RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND SCIENTIFIC RELEVANCE

Research question: How international educational public policies have been affected by local situations?

Hypotheses to explore: Local situations that affect the input of educational public policy. Adaptation of educational policies. Impact of not adapting educational policies to the social situation.

Scientific Relevance: Contemporary societies face a globalized world by adjusting to public policies that are adopted from other parts of the world and often adapted. This process of adaptation may include both policies and the parameters from where the idea originated.

There are instances where these parameters are not adapted according to the plethora of social-economic realities and policies of the State. When adaptations are not made, it gives way to a possible aperture from where emerging issues may arise. For instance, clashes between cultural and economic realities which affect the fulfilment of the objectives of the policy.

This can be observed especially in educational policies, where countries adopt policies and parameters that are foreign to the community. This may lead to the application of policies that at the end do not achieve the final objectives, as the policies are not correspondingly to the varying realities of each community, society, or territory. Moreover, how this can affect the expected result or even the application of public policies.

In recent years, some studies have focused on educational policies and their implementation within multi-ethnic or at-risk societies. It is since these settings do not have as much data collection when compared to other studies concerning policies.

For example, in the case of Colombia, the Ministry of Education has decided that the country necessitated a transition into globalization. The nation started this process with adopting the CEFR as the main source of reference as the answer to learning, teaching and assessment processes. Elaboration of syllabuses, curriculum guidelines, question papers, textbooks, and so forth is what CEFR provides as a common ground on language acquisition and learning. (Council of Europe, 2001). In essence, such constructs unify the criteria amongst any given country to generate well outlined learning programs and certifications. Despite these functions, CEFR is alien to Colombia's reality.

CALL FOR PAPERS

For this panel, both chair and co-chairs expect papers that analyze from theory or real cases. The implication that the implementation of educational public policies designed in different States and contexts can have in the communities when they are not adapted to the specific context. We wish to find papers, namely, those regarding the phenomenon of externalization of public policies focused on learning, no matter the level that they refer to. The analysis can be focused on a single case or multiple cases observations where it is possible to see the theoretical or practical impact of this for the students or communities.

T06P02 / Educational policies application outside the original territory for which they were created

Chair : Rubén Palacio (Universidad de Medellín)

Second Chair : Esteban Vasquez (Universidad de Medellín)

Third Chair : Sebastian Hurtado Correa (Universidad de Medellín)

Session 1 AFTERNOON SESSION

Thursday, July 8th 14:00 to 16:00 (252)

(Virtual) Implementing citizenship education policy: The case of Estonia

Leif Kalev (Tallinn University)

Nikolai Kunitsõn (Tallinn University)

In this paper we study citizenship education in Estonian secondary school with a key interest in policy implementation. The content of civics and its implementation is analysed based on the normative perspectives on citizenship. We discuss the multi-layer implementation process focusing on teachers as street level bureaucrats exercising a wide discretion in decisions.

We are broadly based on the tradition of educational policy implementation studies and consider the cultural or argumentative turn in policy sciences where language is of central importance. Our key focus is on teachers and their understandings and teaching and learning contexts, but we discuss this related to civics as a national policy resource and as reflected by the students.

The questions for the empirical analysis are: (1) How are the main normative perspectives to citizenship constructed in the secondary school framework curriculum and civics subject outline? (2) How do civics teachers transform the regulations in curricula into the content of their subject? What is the role of the teacher agency in this process? (3) What is the teachers' interpretation of students' perception of civics topics? How is it reflected in students' experience?

The article concludes with discussion of the results and policy suggestions.

The impact of quality assurance on paraguayan higher education: evidence of a survey to technical quality units

Shirley Gomez (Universitat Pompeu Fabra)

Which is the impact of the policies of quality assurance in the universities of Paraguay? In the last years, quality of higher education has become particularly relevant in a context of globalization. In many countries, regulatory agencies, responsible to supervise and control the compliance of quality criteria, were created. In Paraguay the agency of evaluation and accreditation of the quality of higher education was created by a process of diffusion from the regional level in the year 2003. This situation has been reflected in the internal organization of the universities, that have been obliged to create new structures, responsible for the implementation of quality processes. However, currently not much is known about how these structures work. To fill that gap, this article will present the preliminary results for Paraguay of the "International survey to internal units of quality assurance" that is being carried out nowadays. The goal of this survey is to better understand the process of implementation of quality criteria in public and private universities in the country. Moreover, this survey maps the relations between these internal units and other actors, internal and external to the university, which were relevant during the process of implementation of quality policies.

This survey is structured in 5 parts: (1) Identification of the surveyed person and of the units; (2) Activities, responsibilities and methodologies of evaluation; (3) Quality culture; (4) Rating of quality processes; and (5) Rating of the quality assurance regulatory agency.

(Virtual) The adaptation of European education policies, norms and culture in Central Asia: Bologna Process and Kazakhstan

Aray Ilyassova-Schoenfeld (Nazarbayev University)

The aim of this paper is to examine the influence and effects of the Bologna reforms on higher education in Kazakhstan. Being a first and only Central Asian country, Kazakhstan signed the Bologna Declaration in 2010. The research question is to what extent have the Bologna reforms been adopted in Kazakhstan? Empirical data were collected through semi-structured interviews and document analysis. The research results will be presented via an in-depth case study.

Policymakers sought 'new' knowledge and policy ideas from other systems that were compatible with their ideological and cultural perspectives. This approach refers to 'soft' forms of transfer, particularly the transfer of knowledge. However, how 'soft' forms of transfer and cross-state lessons should be drawn is a problematic question because there is no specific guidance for each state.

Many non-European countries have joined the Bologna Process (BP) in the hope of improving and harmonizing their education systems with those of Europe. Kazakhstan is one such country. Strategically, state officials have sought to adopt European standards where possible. In this spirit, joining the BP was supposed to help Kazakhstan to harmonize its educational system with European standards with respect to specialist training. However, due to wide-ranging socio-political, cultural, and institutional differences between Kazakhstan and Europe, this harmonization process has proved difficult. The Soviet educational system that Kazakhstan inherited from the USSR was completely different from Western educational systems in terms of learning periods, degrees, credits, and curricula. In the Soviet system, there was five years of education with a narrow specialization for each sector of the economy. In Europe, the system of education is very flexible and broad; after attaining a bachelor's degree students can suspend their studies or they can pursue a master's degree in a different field.

The BP has no mechanism that requires strict compliance with rules or laws, however it has been perceived differently in post-Soviet states. Courtesy of 'the Soviet legacy' of inertia, in such states if there is a process where officials are involved (i.e. ministers), then it is considered to be of an obligatory nature. When referring to the 'Soviet legacy', this means the heritage of a vertical governance and centralised planned economy, when education was influenced by communist ideology.

Has Kazakhstan achieved its intended goal of developing its national education system in compliance with the BP or not? The research shows that the adoption of the BP has encountered problems at institutional level in Kazakhstan during its implementation. The academic community in the country has attempted to implement a new model with new terms and titles, but little change has been made with respect to content in the academic programs, teaching style, or the methods of conducting research. In practice, academics still tend to rely on techniques and approaches associated with their Soviet educational heritage. This institutional culture remains somewhat entrenched in the Soviet system, and this restricts the full implementation of a Western educational model in terms of institutional culture, norms, and values.

T06P02 / Educational policies application outside the original territory for which they were created

Chair : Rubén Palacio (Universidad de Medellín)

Second Chair : Esteban Vasquez (Universidad de Medellín)

Third Chair : Sebastian Hurtado Correa (Universidad de Medellín)

Session 2AFTERNOON SESSION

Friday, July 9th 14:00 to 16:00 (252)

(Virtual) Between Global Trends and Local Realities: The Emergence of National Quality Assurance System in Turkish Higher Education

Burhan FINDIKLI (University of Bergen)

National educational policies in a globalized world are often transferred from a global setting and adapted into the local context. The Bologna Process, which created the European Higher Education Area (EHEA) that aims to make higher education systems of the signatory countries comparable and compatible with each other, formed a global trend as it has affected regions beyond Europe and formed what is called an “international higher education regime” (Zahavi & Friedman, 2019). In the literature, concepts such as policy borrowing and lending, policy transfer, and policy convergence have been frequently deployed to analyze the extent to which the Bologna Process as an international factor has led to the convergence and similarities across countries in terms of change outcomes (Heinze & Knill, 2008; Vögtle, 2014).

This paper focuses on the gradual establishment of a national quality assurance system in Turkish higher education as an example of policy transfer through its integration into the EHEA. Prior to the Bologna Process, the idea of a quality assurance system or outcome-based learning were minor concerns for policymakers, if they were not totally alien (Onursal-Be?göl, 2017). In the first place, the Council of Higher Education (CHE), the central body responsible for systemic governance, coordination, regulation, and planning, was seen as sufficient to ensure quality in the sector. The policy transfer process eventually led to the emergence of a national body responsible for quality assurance.

The paper tries to answer the question of how the idea of quality assurance and practices associated with it was understood by policymakers and translated into the local context. Besides, the paper will also focus on the translation process, i.e., the mechanism through which the foreign elements such as quality assurance were modified and attached to the existing institutions. The empirical evidence was gathered through legislative and policy documents, semi-structured expert interviews with policy actors, and the available secondary sources.

References

Heinze, T., & Knill, C. (2008). Analysing the differential impact of the Bologna Process: Theoretical considerations on national conditions for international policy convergence. *Higher education*, 56(4), 493-510.

Onursal-Be?göl, Ö. (2017). Translating norms from Europe to Turkey: Turkey in the Bologna Process. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 47(5), 742-755.

Vögtle, E. M. (2014). *Higher education policy convergence and the Bologna Process: A cross-national study*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Zahavi, H., & Friedman, Y. (2019). The Bologna Process: an international higher education regime. *European Journal of Higher Education*, 9(1), 23-39.

Consequences of implementing not adapted educational public policies to vulnerable contexts: lessons from “Aprende en Casa” during confinement in Mexico

Jorge Gonzalez Cruz (CIDE- Center for Learning on Evaluation and Results for Latin America and The Caribbean (CLEAR LAC))

Claudia Ileana Espinosa Díaz (Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México)

Since March of 2020, as a measure to mitigate the transmission of the SARS-CoV2 virus in the population, the government of Mexico implemented the suspension of school activities at all educational levels. This situation led to the implementation of “Aprende en Casa”, a long-distance education public program that aimed to continue offering classes for students of primary and secondary levels during the confinement, through tv lessons and video recording sessions uploaded to an internet platform.

In this context, the only way students could continue with their studies depends on their possibility to have internet connection and/or access to a TV with national signal. For many countries this could not be a problem, but in a country where half of the population lives in poverty and where indigenous communities are segregated, connectivity to everybody is not possible.

The measurement was adopted from other parts of the world but was not adapted to the context. Even, within Mexico, the initiative was not adjusted to different contexts and characteristics of the students. As a consequence, in a region as San Cristobal de las Casas-Chiapas, where social mobility is limited, where 7 out of 10 boys and girls are poor, where almost half of the population is indigenous, and where the access and use of these technologies is limited, education at all levels is in crisis and emerging issues implementing “Aprende en Casa” may arise.

This paper analyzes, with quantitative and qualitative techniques, the experiences, perceptions, feelings and concerns that Tsotsil, Tzeltal and Mestizo boys, girls and adolescents (NNA) had with “Aprende en Casa” during the first months of confinement in Mexico. The information come from a telephone survey to 8 to 17 years old NNA run by Civil Society Organizations in the region. Its objective was to understand under what conditions does NNA live the confinement and what are the worries that arise in their context.

The main results show that students perceived that they learn less at home than when they were at the school and perceived more difficulty doing homework, with leads to ask for help with other persons in the family. Also, show that their principal concern refers to the possibility to drop-out the school, mainly for girls and women adolescents. In addition, the results are segregated by other characteristics and show different perceptions according to students’ age, sex, level of education and ethnic.

This study allows to generate knowledge about the implementation of “Aprende en Casa” for students in most vulnerable conditions in Mexico, and helps to understand the problems that lack of adaptability of an educational public policy may develop in less developed contexts. The results generate recommendations of public policy than can be applied to similar programs and comparable contexts in other countries of the region.

(Virtual) Education policy analysis: Case study of the Regional Education Funding Reform the Czech Republic

Karel Gargulák (Faculty of Social Sciences, Charles university)

Kateřina Konrádová (Charles University Prague)

The present is characterised by significantly higher levels of dynamics, complexity and volatility of social processes and relations. Instability and complexity manifest also in the domain of politics and policy making. These facts lead many authors and Public Policy analysts (e.g. Cairney et al., 2019) to create new paradigmatic approaches based on the description of the behaviour of continuously changing complex systems. Therefore, more than ever it is expedient to engage – from the perspective of producing scientific and empirical knowledge – in a detailed examination of the individual cases of policy making. It is necessary to reconstruct the social reality so that we understand the new dynamics of political decision making and the relevant processes. This trend, or perspective, leads to the return of an inductive approach to generating scientific knowledge and theories. Following a period of predominance of grander theories, or theoretical streams, and attempts to explain the political process by means of the deductive approach (including verifying those theories), attention is now shifted also toward inductive approaches.

Case study, which has as its objective to provide a deep understanding or causal explanation of the case that, at the same time, takes into consideration the overall context of the phenomenon under study, represents the most widely used design of qualitative policy research. (e.g. Gerring, 2004; Yin, 1994) It is also the main research strategy used in our paper.

The main goal of our panel proposal is to describe and to explain the policy making process. The subject of our research is specific policy processes in the field of education policy. In 2020, the new system of funding public schools from the state budget, which has been introduced by the Amendment to the Education Act, is in force. The resources for individual schools are now set by the Ministry of Education, the regional authorities have only a limited power. The mechanism used for the calculation of the assigned funds has also changed.

In our proposal we will address the following research questions:

- What were the main stages of this policy making process?
- Who were the main stakeholders and decision-makers?
- What were the objectives of the policy associated with?
- What problems should the policy address?
- Why was the given design of policy outcomes chosen?
- Why were the policy outcomes accepted or not?

Answers to these questions are based on several data collection methods: a) secondary data (qualitative and quantitative data analysed during desk research) and b) primary data (semi-structured and loosely structured interviews with relevant actors). In addition to that, literature review, analysis of relevant documents and media analysis is applied.

The present is characterised by significantly higher levels of dynamics, complexity and volatility of social processes and relations. Instability and complexity manifest also in the domain of politics and policy making. These facts lead many authors and Public Policy analysts (e.g. Cairney et al., 2019) to create new paradigmatic approaches based on the description of the behaviour of continuously changing complex systems. Therefore, more than ever it is expedient to engage – from the perspective of producing scientific and empirical knowledge – in a detailed examination of the individual cases of policy making. It is necessary to reconstruct the social reality so that we understand the new dynamics of political decision making and the relevant processes. This trend, or perspective, leads to the return of an inductive approach to generating scientific knowledge and theories. Following a period of predominance of grander theories, or theoretical streams, and attempts to explain the political process by means of the deductive approach (including verifying those theories), attention is now shifted also toward inductive approaches.

Case study, which has as its objective to provide a deep understanding or causal explanation of the case that, at the same time, takes into consideration the overall context of the phenomenon under study, represents the most widely used design of qualitative policy research. (Gerring, 2004; Yin, 1994) It is also the main research strategy used in our paper.

The main goal of our panel proposal is to describe and to explain the policy making process. The subject of our research is specific policy processes in the field of education policy. In 2020, the new system of funding public schools from the state budget, which has been introduced by the Amendment to the Education Act, is in force. The resources for individual schools are now set by the Ministry of Education, the regional authorities have only a limited power. The mechanism used for the calculation of the assigned funds has also changed.

In our proposal we will address the following research questions:

- What were the main stages of this policy making process?
- Who were the main stakeholders and decision-makers?
- What were the objectives of the policy associated with?
- What problems should the policy address?
- Why was the given design of policy outcomes chosen?
- Why were the policy outcomes accepted or not?

Answers to these questions are based on several data collection methods: a) secondary data (qualitative and quantitative data analysed during desk research) and b) primary data (semi-structured and loosely structured interviews with relevant actors). In addition to that, literature review, analysis of relevant documents and media analysis is applied.

Literature:

Cairney, P., Heikkila, T., & Wood, M. (2019). *Making Policy in a Complex World (Elements in Public Policy)*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. doi:10.1017/9781108679053

Gerring, John. (2004). What is a case study and what is it good for? *American political science review*, 98(02), 341-354.

Yin, Robert. (1994). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Beverly Hills: CA: Sage publishing.