T01P03 / Roles of Trust in Policy Process

Topic : T01 / Policy Process Theories
Chair : Hyung Jun Park (Sungkyunkwan University)
Second Chair : Minhyo Cho (Sungkyunkwan University)

GENERAL OBJECTIVES, RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND SCIENTIFIC RELEVANCE

From the perspective of governance and social capital, trust is conceptualized as a critical contextual element which enables cooperation and facilitates actors to participate in the public policy process as well as resolves conflicts. This is because trust and network reduces the transaction costs involved in mutual distrust and the monitoring process.

Most studies of social capital have focused on collaboration or government trust of which citizens possess. Government trust enhances the policy compliance of citizens and induces continuous and pragmatic responses to complex problems. However, extant studies are limited in discussing the scope of government-citizen collaboration by assuming a unilateral direction of trust on part of the citizens toward their government. This panel defines the level of trustworthiness that the public policymaker has towards citizens as a major factor in the policymaking process. That is, we believe that trustworthy behavior and characteristics of citizens are important elements in determining the level of trust public policymakers possess toward them. The ability, benevolence, and integrity of citizens compose the indicators of their trustworthiness. At the same time, perceptions or judgments of the trustworthiness of citizens are affected by diverse interactions and role perceptions that the public policymakers hold. The interaction public policy makers have with citizens needs to be carefully analyzed through the institutional mechanisms of interaction and the group characteristics of citizens.

CALL FOR PAPERS

The purpose of this panel is to bring together scholars and practitioners from diverse public policy fields and countries to discuss theoretical and practical issues of the "Role of Trust in Public Policy Processes Under Complexity". The panel aims to offer a valuable opportunity to discuss various roles of trust in each countries' policy process. We welcome theory-driven research as well as practical case studies with comparative perspectives.

The panel collects both theoretical and empirical papers exploring different expressions of citizens' trust and distrust in their governments as well as the interplay between policymakers' level of trust toward their citizenry and policy outcome. The objective is to explore the links between trust in government and the policies and institutions of public governance. Papers can cover how trust and specifically trust in government can be defined, how it is measured, and how it may influence citizens attitudes and responses to public policies. In addition, the panel is interested in questions that address trust of government in citizens and organizations and trust within government. Specifically, trust on part of policymakers on their citizens and organizations shape policy design and its outcomes – i.e., the degree of government trust on citizens and businesses is reflected in how government functions and how public services are organized as well as their efficiency and effectiveness.

Questions the papers could address include, but are not limited to, for example: (i) How do institutions condition the environment to reinforce trust between government and citizens in both directions? (ii) How does trust enable and constrain policy effectiveness or change? (iii) How does the level of trust influence governance structure and policy design? Overall, by offering answers to these questions from different political systems and subsystem contexts, this panel will inform the broader literature on the relationship between trust and public policy process. We plan to conduct collaborative research with authors of accepted papers through funding from the Social Science Korea research project – Developing Dynamic Models of Coexistence and Collaboration.

T01P03 / Roles of Trust in Policy Process

Chair : Hyung Jun Park (Sungkyunkwan University)
Second Chair : Minhyo Cho (Sungkyunkwan University)

Session 1 Coexistence & Trust I (SKKU SSK)

Discussants

Hyung Jun Park (Sungkyunkwan University)

David Kasdan (Sung Kyun Kwan University)

Changes of wage gap by gender in Korea from 1985 to 2015: Focusing on women`s career discontinuity

Mingil Kim

Minhyo Cho (Sungkyunkwan University)

According to OECD employment database the ratio of wage gap by gender is 36.7%. It is 22%p higher than OECD average(14.03%). It is the highest ratio in all of the OECD countries. To solve these problems, Korean government enforce 'Equal Employment Opportunity and Work Family Balance Assitance Act' and 'Gender Equality Act'. But wage gap by gender is still big problem in Korea. In this context, I try to analyze changes of wage gap by gender in Korea, and examine how it was changed. For this purpose, I use 'survey on work status by employment type' from 1985 to 2015. This survey was conducted every year to gain insight for the labor policy from work status of laborer.

In many literatures which research wage gap by gender in Korea, the researchers pointed that women`s career discontinuity is critical reason that made wage gap. So, I focus on the career discontinuity to explain cause of wage gap in Korea. So, I use Oaxaca decomposition to analyze wage gap of each year by age. After that I interviewed women who are experienced career discontinuity because of marriage or childcare, and after that came back to labor market. Through the interview, I tried to explain causes of wage gap.

As results, wage gap by gender in 20s and 30s is not changed remarkably from 1985 to 2015, but in 40s the wage gap is increased drastically. And the wage gap of 20s is almost 200,000 KRW(177 USD), 30s` is almost 500,000 KRW(443 USD) and 40s` is almost 850,000 KRW(752 USD) in 1985 and 1,750,000 KRW(1548 USD) in 2015. Many women laborer in 40s experienced career discontinuity and came back to labor market. In this process women lose their specialty and the reemployed in low level job. According to descriptive statistics women in 20s and 30s work as paper worker and expertise whose salary is high, but women in 40s work as simple laborer and service workers whose salary is low.

In the interview, women in 40s said that when they came back to labor market, there are no jobs for women who experienced career discontinuity. In the past, they work as paper workers and expertise, but now they don`t have any choice except service worker or simple laborer. And in Korean context, women have to care about household affair and childcare, so they can not work as fulltime worker.

Considering Oaxaca decomposition and interviews, we conclude that wage cap by gender is affected by women`s career discontinuity. Because of career discontinuity, women lose their specialty and reemployed low level job. And it is important reason to wage gap by gender in Korea

Dynamism of Intergovernmental Conflicts and Cooperation In the Operation of a Non-preferred Public Facility

Sang Joon Shin (SungKyunKwan University)

Lee Sook Jong (SungKyunKwan University)

This case study analyzed the changes of policy networks and private stakeholders' participation in operating the

landfill site of wastes from several Seoul metropolitan areas. South Korean national or wider regional public projects involve multiple local governments, causing either conflicts or cooperation among them. In most of public projects, the interests of involved governments are different from one another and thus conflicts among them arise usually in the early stage. However, governments tend to negotiate and their conflicts come to close in the implementation stage of public projects. In this process, the government roles once advocating local residents are replaced by the ones managing specific issues surrounding the operation of a public facility. These changes in the intergovernmental relations influence the public-private policy networks as well as the local residents participation to change.

The Seoul Metropolitan Waste Landfill Site, which is located in Incheon Seo-gu, is managed by four government organizations: the Seoul City Government, the Gyeonggi Provincial Government, the Incheon City Government, and the Ministry of Environment.. This Waste Landfill Site was planned to be used from 1992 to 2016, but in December 2014, the four governments formed the four-party consultative group and agreed to use the Site for an extended period until the alternative landfill site is secured.

The conflicts surrounding the Seoul Metropolitan Waste Landfill Site can be divided into 3 periods: the conflict initiation period, the conflict escalation period, and the conflict stalemate period. Throughout these periods, several things are noticeable. First, the independent authority of government actors over the operation of this Landfill Site was the important factor in shaping policy networks of each period. Second, the evolving intergovenmental cooperation weakened the participation level of private stakeholders despite their forged coalition. Third, by being faithful to the managerial role in operating the waste disposal program, the government parties intensified the conflicts with local residents. One thing to note is that, since the adjacent two cities and one province in the Seoul metropolitan area are interdependent in responding to common problems of waste disposals, they had the difficulty in terminating the use of the Landfill Site.

Creating organisational trust: A perspective of the South African public service.

enaleen Draai (Nelson Mandela Matropolitan University)

ABSTRACT
Trust in service delivery is critical to the legitimacy with which the organisation and its officials are perceived. Trust ascribed to an organisation is therefore both individual as perceived by a singular client and collective in respect of the nature and scope the organisation in service delivery (Heitzmann and Marson, 2007: 550) Organisational trust is relational and interactional as well as defined by managerial culture that fosters collegial cooperation and excellence but intolerant to maladministration (Franks 2014: 52). Furthermore, managerial insight that is defined not only by knowledge and skill but also by institutional a memory that allows managerial benchmarking and development of a sense of self-awareness as well as foresight and that leads to understanding the opportunities and risks in facilitating service delivery effectively and efficiently.
South Africa is a young representative democracy and a developmental state. Trust in governance structures is paramount for sustainable political stability. The structure of the public service constitutes three spheres that include national, provincial and local government. The public service has experienced significant transformation since the dawn of democracy in 1994. Trust in the political milieu and public service to provide effective and efficient services is particularly important to sustain good governance. However, trust in the public service has often been in question as evidenced by service delivery protests, low levels of client satisfaction, corruption and maladministration (Kroukamp 2016:109). Trust in local government has ebbed very low while trust in national government has ebbed low. The citizen experience of service delivery and consequent perceptions of trust in the public service has been contentious.
The South African government, in terms of its statutory mandates as well as the Bill of Rights, of the Constitution of 1996, is required to enable a satisfactory quality of life for its citizens. Trust held by citizens in the professional competence of the public service has often been contentious as defined by experience and perception of performance.
The South African government introduced policy and strategy reform that require employee and citizen engagement to allow for the development of relational and interactional trust. The policy and strategy reform implemented places emphasis on trust creating and trust restoring initiatives. These initiatives identify citizens and officials as key role players in the co-production of improved organisational trust. The citizen is identified as a key stakeholder in the service delivery value chain to guide and improve the experience and perception of service delivery output and outcome to allow for improved trust organisational.
This paper will refer to aspects of organisational trust as relevant to the public service. The paper address the following question: What is a trustworthy organisation?
Further, contextualise the importance of organisational trust within a developmental context. Refer to policy and statutory prescripts that places emphasis on trust creating and trust restoring initiatives. However, question and highlight the environmental dynamics that may lead only to compliance and not necessarily the crux of the policy objectives that specifies effective and efficient output and outcome. Lastly refer to lessons learnt specifically from environmental factors that necessitates policy change.

Influence of government justice perception on citizens' trust in government: With mediating effects of perception on public conflicts

Joohyun Kim

Lee Sook Jong (SungKyunKwan University)

This study analyze how citizens' perception of government justice influences on their trust in government, and measures if citizens' perception of public conflicts mediates between these two variables. Perception of government justice was measured by two elements of law enforcement agencies, police and court, and civil service provided by administrative agencies. This study found that both perceptions on government justice and government-civic conflicts have a significant influence on trust in government. Citizens' perception of public conflicts has a slightly weak influence on government trust, but a statistically significant influence on trust in government. On the basis of these results, we can suggest that government should perform its service and law enforcement fairer to get citizens' trust in government. In particular, government needs to show its ability when managing and resolving public conflicts to boost citizens' thinking that their government is just and trustworthy.

[Key words: government justice, trust in government, public conflict]

Analysis of the difference in students' academic achievement by district in Seoul: Focused on the neighborhood effect

Ki duck Jung

Minhyo Cho (Sungkyunkwan University)

The difference in students' academic achievement among residences is huge in South Korea. A micro-level factor which influences students' academic achievement is a student's family background. Moreover, a student's school environment includes a student's peers and teachers who can provide supportive relationships that can increase academic achievement. Yet, one important factor highly influential in explaining a student's academic achievement remains less well understood: the residence where the student lives. Importantly, what kinds of neighborhood characteristics matter for students' academic achievement is an unresolved question lacking solid empirical footing. This is critical to understand the difference in students' academic achievement among districts in Korea. Furthermore, knowing the degree to which neighborhood characteristics influence educational outcomes is important to our understanding the processes that reproduce social inequality. If a specific neighborhood characteristic impacts students' academic achievement, then can make a policy to resolve the difference of students' academic achievement among residences and social inequality considering neighborhood effects.

The purpose of this study is to examine the differences in students' academic achievement according to district in Seoul and to further identify what makes the differences focusing on neighborhood characteristics. We use combined dataset, individual data from the Seoul Educational Longitudinal Study (2015) and resident data from the national official survey. In our quantitative investigation, we analyze the sum of language, math and English score with which district Korean students live in. The characteristics according to district are including the average education level and monthly household income of residence, the percentage of having exalted occupation in residence, the capability of collecting information about child's education, the number of private educational institution, the number of juvenile crime, the local education grant, and the number of adult establishment. We use multiple regression models to analyze the effect of neighborhood characteristics including family background and school environment variables on students' academic achievement.

Results indicated that the education level of parent in family background and the school satisfaction level in school environment variables have positive effect on a student's academic achievement; furthermore, the relationship with peers and teachers do not have significant effect on the academic achievement, but students whose parents participate in school activities is more likely to get higher score compared to whose parents do not participate in. Discussing the neighborhood characteristics, the average monthly household income of residence and capability of collecting information about child's education, how much information that parents can get from others about school or private education, have positive effect on the academic achievement in consideration of family background and school variables. On the other hand, we found that the local education grant negatively affects the academic achievement.

The Influence of Citizens' Political Participation on Their Trust in Government

HAN SEONGMIN (skku)

Lee Sook Jong (SungKyunKwan University)

This study aims to answer two questions. One is how much trust the citizens with political interests hold toward their government. Second is how citizens' political participation influence their trust in government . According to the statistical n analysis of the 2011 survey data, citizens who participated in the public hearings dealing with a region problem had more institutional trust in all of the National Assembly, the government, and the judiciary t. Since the participating rate of public hearings is not high despite this importance, it is desirable to develop some measures to encourage citizens to participate in such activity.

T01P03 / Roles of Trust in Policy Process

Chair : Hyung Jun Park (Sungkyunkwan University)
Second Chair : Minhyo Cho (Sungkyunkwan University)

Session 2 Trust and Government(SKKU SSK)

Friday, June 30th 10:30 to 12:30 (Block B 4 - 3)

Discussants

Minhyo Cho (Sungkyunkwan University)

Kyujin Jung (Korea University)

Dynamics of Multi-level Policy Process and Multiple Stream Framework: Matching between politic stream and problem fit

Hyung Jun Park (Sungkyunkwan University)

JIYE JU (Sungkyunkwan University)

JIHYUNG LEE (Sungkyunkwan University)

Policy implementation has been performed in various ways across levels of government. To study why policies are implemented differently through policy decision or change, scholars in the field of policy or public administration have worked with a certain or in conjunction with diversity of approaches. The multiple streams approach developed by John Kingdon has been used in policy implementation, recently, since acknowledgement of policy agenda and policy decision. On the basis of this approach, this study suggests politic stream and problem stream have important influence on the type of implementation. Politic stream is defined as a political pressure from the center government, problem streams is translated in a concept of problem fit. These two streams can create four types of scenario of policy implementation. Each scenario explain how a type of policy implementation is formed through all policy making process from agenda to implementation by three streams: politic stream, problem stream, policy stream. To test how three streams effect the type of policy implementation under the model this study designed, existing three policy cases which are implemented and changed in Korea are examined. The result of empirical analysis for all cases support that political pressure and problem fit can shape the type of policy implementation. The findings provide a predictability of a type of implementation of a certain policy during policy making and implies how to promote a policy in all policy process to make more reasonable or effective implementation.

Revisiting Dynamics of Social Capital, Government Performance, and Government Trust: Does "Asian Context" Matter?

SANG OK CHOI (Korea University)

Kee Hoon Chung (Korea University)

Existing literature generally agree social capital can play an important role mediating between government performance and government trust. Whether such theory holds in Asian context, however, requires greater examination; not only has there not been much empirical investigation, but the findings have not been consistent with many of existing literatures. For example, Kim (2005) finds that social capital was negatively associated with political trust in South Korea, contrary from existing literature that emphasizes a positive effect social capital can have on the performance and trust. While Kim's finding makes important contribution, yet important questions still remain. Specifically, do existing literatures on this topic show enough empirical evidence to theorize different mechanism in Asia? Reviewing existing literature on this topic, we could not find research that specifically focused on Asia. Second, if such thing as Asian context exists, then what's the causal mechanism behind it? Although Kim's research highlights the differing result, its limitation comes from explaining the causal mechanism of why such difference arises.
In this context, this research makes significant contributions to the existing volumes in several ways. First, using

more recent dataset, the SAIS-USKI (Johns Hopkins Study of Advanced International Studies, U.S. Korea Institute) survey 2011, this research attempts to validate whether Kim (2005)'s finding holds. Second, we apply more rigorous method to test Kim's result. In reality, social capital and elements of government performance interact to affect government trust. However, in many literatures, including Kim's, the effect of interaction has not been incorporated. As a result, the analysis does not incorporate the degree in which social capital mediate government performance, but rather, only examines specific effects of government performance after controlling for social capital. Finally, this research offers an explanation for Asian mechanism. Given the national context of South Korea, different contextual factors may have a stronger explanatory power than social capital affecting government trust. Specifically, since our data comes from South Korea, we employ two contextual factors – political ideology and media perception – that we assess may have stronger effect on perception of government trust than social capital.

Overall, our research makes significant contributions to the existing literatures on integrative model of government trust through offering explanation for different dynamic between social capital, government performance, and government trust.

The Governmental Governance and Trust in Government in the Process of Chinese State Governance ——Investigation based on the Perspective of Policy Process

Wang Jiayan (Nanjing Normal University)

Abstract: Trust in government is the emotional tie to uphold the mutual cooperation and co-governance of state between the government and citizens. Building the trust in government is also the inevitable requirement of comprehensively deepen reform under the condition of Chinese socialist market economy. In the practice of the governmental governance, the publicity nature of government and it's maintenance of public interest are reflected in the process of public policy. In the transition period of China, public policies can't always meet the citizens' expectations of the government duo to the deviation, to some extent, of publicity nature of public policies, which in turn leading to the pessimistic situation of the governmental credibility. Specifically, the disorder of elite decision-making and the weak public opinion aggregation, the disadvantages of cross-use of the bureaucratic mode and mobilization pattern in the process of policy implementation, as well as achievements championship under "pressure-type system", constitute the policy logics behind the current pessimistic situation of trust in Chinese government.

Key words: Governmental Governance; Trust in Government; Public Policy; Policy Process; Publicity

Locating trust relations in the Australian policy process

Yvonne Haigh (Murdoch University)

Peter Wilkins (Curtin University)

Trust and accountability are key qualities that underpin the public policy process. This paper situates these core qualities in line with evolving literature on new public management and governance, with a specific emphasis on the role of 'watchdog agencies' in the Australian policy process. The paper demonstrates that trust and accountability are inextricably linked, however, these agencies utilise different forms of expertise and knowledge in conditioning the environment to engender trust between government and citizens. Watchdog agencies, also referred to as integrity agencies are central to the transmission of expertise and knowledge of appropriate, effective and lawful policy processes. The paper positions these agencies as conduits between citizens, public servants and policy makers. This paper draws on three cases studies from Australian public sector agencies as a form of comparison between the dynamics necessary for enhancing a range of trust relations. The paper examines a range of cases from Auditors' General, Ombudsman offices and anti-corruption agencies across Australia in the period 2006 - 2014. These agencies specialise in scrutinising the behaviour and decision making of public figures which reinforces the nature of these agencies as independent 'watchdogs' and agencies that aim to promote trust and accountability in the broader public. As agencies that enact legitimised review processes there is little understanding however as to the knowledge and expertise each agency brings to ensuring trust is a key element of the policy process. The case studies highlight different aspects of the dynamics around trust, these include the role of systems, the importance of familiarity and the significance of context. The paper draws on three regimes of trust – institutional, calculus and relational (Bouckaert 2011) as a way to examine the different conditions that contribute to trust across multiple levels of society. The paper examines a selection of departmental governance frameworks, Annual Reports and changes to the role of the Auditor General as a primary data source. The paper argues therefore that trust functions on multiple levels and through multiple processes which have significant implications for the development of sound policy processes within and across agencies and the broader society.

The relationship of trust and voting behavior in El Salvador elections

Isabel Buechsel (Democratic Literacy Project)

Empirical evidence shows that Social Capital, characterized by individual involvement in a variety of civic organizations, has positive effect on institutional effectiveness. One of the six dimensions of social capital is generalized trust. This study collected data from 377 individuals immediately after issuing their vote during the latest presidential elections in El Salvador.

Utilizing questions from Grootaert et al.'s 2004 instrument to measure the six dimensions of Social Capital, the study found a positive correlation between the the degree of trust individuals expressed towards members of the organizations in which they participated and the expectation that their vote would make a difference in society at large.

State to the test of trust: implementation of a public fee exemption policy in non-state facilities in Benin

Jean-Paul Dossou (Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium)

In 2009, the Benin government introduced the fee exemption for caesarean section policy for all women with a medical indication in 44 accredited public and private-not-for profit facilities (later extended to 48). Under the policy, government pays a fixed sum of €152 for each caesarean section to the facility. The objective of this study was to assess the adoption of the policy by both types of facilities. The study adopted the realist evaluation approach and used the embedded case study design. We made use of the most comprehensive evaluation data available to date on this policymaking and implementation processes, and collected additional qualitative and quantitative date within the FEMHealth research programme.

Besides the state-owned facilities, government decided to include not-for-profit non-state actors, rather than engaging all the non-state actors, on the basis that the former shared the value of public oriented services and that they thus could be trusted to implement the policy. However, we found that non-state facilities kept charging the patients €45 extra. The analysis shows how implementation of this policy by non-state facilities depends how top-down and bottom-up trust is facilitated.

In contexts where the public administration is seen as too bureaucratic, slow, and unreliable in its financial procedures, managers perceive a fee exemption policy as a threat, especially if out-of pocket payment is the main financing mechanism. In such cases, charging an extra fee is a safety measure, grounded on mistrust in government. To allow full adoption and consequently fully free access o services, as intended by the policy requires trust between non-state actors and government. Trust is likely to be facilitated by three mechanisms: (1) removing the risk of losing resources, for instance by setting up of specialized implementing units, with simple, clear, transparent and fast administrative procedures and refunds; (2) short-term financial loss compensation in case of delayed reimbursements; (3) fairness in resource allocation between public and private hospitals. These measures would increase trust and thus facilitate the full adoption of the policy by non-state facilities. In a context, where public investments in private facilities were absent before the initiation of the policy, such perceived fairness requires equity rather than equality in resource allocation.

This study showed a dynamic interplay between political needs, power and trust at the interface between the public and private health sector in Benin, a low-income country. Trust plays a key role in this interaction and is a vital element for low-income countries to achieve universal health coverage.